

California Energy Commission  
**STAFF REPORT**

# **LOCALIZED HEALTH IMPACTS REPORT**

Addendum 1 for Selected Projects Awarded Funding  
Through the Alternative and Renewable Fuel and  
Vehicle Technology Program Under Solicitation GFO-  
18-601-Community-Scale and Commercial-Scale  
Advanced Biofuels Production Facilities

**California Energy Commission**  
Gavin Newsom, Governor



**May 2019 | CEC-600-2019-010-AD1**

# California Energy Commission

Jonathan Bobadilla

**Primary Author**

Taiying Zhang

**Project Manager**

Elizabeth John

**Office Manager**

**ADVANCED FUEL PRODUCTION OFFICE**

Kevin Barker

**Deputy Director**

**FUELS AND TRANSPORTATION DIVISION**

Drew Bohan

**Executive Director**

## DISCLAIMER

Staff members of the California Energy Commission prepared this report. As such, it does not necessarily represent the views of the Energy Commission, its employees, or the State of California. The Energy Commission, the State of California, its employees, contractors and subcontractors make no warrant, express or implied, and assume no legal liability for the information in this report; nor does any party represent that the uses of this information will not infringe upon privately owned rights. This report has not been approved or disapproved by the Energy Commission nor has the Commission passed upon the accuracy or adequacy of the information in this report.

# ADDENDUM 1

The Localized Health Impacts (LHI) Report for Selected Projects Awarded Funding Through the Alternative and Renewable Fuel and Vehicle Technology Program Under Solicitation GFO-18-601 (GFO-18-601) was posted on March 11, 2019 (Publication: CEC-600-2019-010).<sup>1</sup> This addendum uses the same approach to assess the LHI information for new project locations.

The applicant identified in the original LHI Report, East Bay Municipal Utility District, is no longer an awardee under GFO-18-601. Energy Commission staff is proposing Rialto Bioenergy Facility LLC (Rialto) for project funding under GFO-18-601. Table 1 lists the awardees, along with the title of their project, proposed location, and environmental justice (EJ) indicators corresponding to the proposed location.<sup>2</sup> EJ indicator definitions are in Appendix A of this LHI report.

**Table 1: Project Details Along With EJ Indicators**

Awardee	Project Title	Project Location	EJ Indicator(s)
East Bay Municipal Utility District	Renewable Natural Gas Production for Transportation Fuel at a Wastewater Treatment Facility	2020 Wake Avenue, Oakland, CA 94607	N/A
Rialto Bioenergy Facility LLC	Phase 2 Biomethane for Waste Management Refueling	503 East Santa Ana Avenue Bloomington, CA 92376	Poverty and Minority

Source: Energy Commission staff

Funding for projects resulting from this solicitation are contingent upon the approval at a publicly noticed Energy Commission Business Meeting and execution of a grant agreement.

## Project Description

Rialto proposes to design, build, and commission a renewable natural gas (RNG) production system in Bloomington. The system will use wastewater treatment plant organic waste to produce RNG suitable for compressed natural gas vehicles. Rialto estimates this project will produce 2.5 million diesel gallon equivalents (DGE) of RNG while also helping displace 97,158 metric tons of carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) annually. Rialto also commits to focusing hiring efforts on the local community by posting job openings

---

<sup>1</sup> Bobadilla, Jonathan. 2019. *Localized Health Impacts Report Under Solicitation GFO-18-601-Community-Scale and Commercial-Scale Advanced Biofuels Production Facilities*. California Energy Commission, Fuels and Transportation Division. Publication Number: CEC-600-2019-010.

<sup>2</sup> EJ indicators developed by the United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA), Office of Policy. Available at <https://www.epa.gov/ejscreen/environmental-justice-indexes-ejscreen>.

directly within the community through fliers and other outreach, and by working with the local Rialto Economic Development Center.

## Location Analysis Summary

Project sites located within a nonattainment zone that have more than one EJ indicator (see Table 1) are identified by staff as a high-risk community project location. If a project within a nonattainment zone has more than one EJ indicator (shown in Table 1), staff will identify it as a high-risk community project location. A high-risk community project location will have the city name in red font, and the percentage values of the EJ indicator thresholds exceeded highlighted in yellow in Table 2. See Appendix A for more details on the assessment method used in this LHI report.

**Table 2: EJ Indicators Compared With California**

	<b>Below Poverty Level (2017)</b>	<b>Black Persons (2017)</b>	<b>American Indian and/or Alaska Native (2017)</b>	<b>Asian and/or Pacific Islander (2017)</b>	<b>Persons of Hispanic or Latino Origin (2017)</b>	<b>Persons Under 5 Years of Age (2017)</b>	<b>Persons Over 65 Years of Age (2017)</b>	<b>Unemployment (January 2019)</b>
California	11.1%	5.8%	0.7%	14.5%	38.8%	6.4%	13.2%	4.8%
EJ Indicator Threshold	>11.1%	>30%	>30%	>30%	>30%	≥26.4%	≥33.2%	>4.8%
<b>Bloomington</b>	<b>14.3%</b>	3.3%	1.1%	1.3%	<b>81.7%</b>	6.2%	10.2%	4.5%

Sources: California Energy Commission staff, Employment Development Department, and U.S. Census Bureau.

\*The city/county names in red indicate a high-risk community, while the yellow highlighted percentages indicate which categories exceed the EJ indicator threshold.

Based on CARB air quality monitoring data,<sup>3</sup> Bloomington falls within a nonattainment zone for ozone and PM<sub>10</sub>, which indicates there may be poor air quality at or near Rialto's proposed project location. Staff identifies the proposed project location in Bloomington as a high-risk community project location due to falling within a nonattainment zone that have more than one EJ indicator (shown in Table 1). Staff does not anticipate significant increases in criteria and toxic emissions that would lead to adverse health impacts on local communities.

## Public Comment

As provided by Title 13 CCR § 2343 of the California Code of Regulations, a 30-day public review period applies to this LHI report from the date it is posted on the Energy

---

<sup>3</sup> See <https://www.arb.ca.gov/desig/adm/adm.htm>.

Commission website. The original posting date for this report is listed at:

<https://www.energy.ca.gov/altfuels/documents/index.html>.

The Energy Commission encourages comments by email. Please include your name or organization's name in the name of the file. Send comments in either Microsoft® Word format (.doc) or Adobe® Acrobat® format (.pdf) to [FTD@energy.ca.gov](mailto:FTD@energy.ca.gov).

The public can email comments to [FTD@energy.ca.gov](mailto:FTD@energy.ca.gov) or send them to:

California Energy Commission  
Fuels and Transportation Division  
1516 Ninth Street, MS-44  
Sacramento, CA 95814-5512

All written comments will become part of the public record and may be posted to the Internet.

News media should direct inquiries to the Media and Public Communications Office at (916) 654-4989, or by e-mail at [mediaoffice@energy.ca.gov](mailto:mediaoffice@energy.ca.gov).

# APPENDIX A:

## Localized Health Impacts Report Method

---

This LHI report assesses the potential health impacts to communities from projects proposed to receive ARFVTP funding. This LHI report is prepared under the *California Code of Regulations, Title 13, Motor Vehicles, Chapter 8.1 (CCR § 2343)*:

“(6) Localized health impacts must be considered when selecting projects for funding. The funding agency must consider EJ consistent with state law and complete the following:

(A) For each fiscal year, the funding agency must publish a staff report for review and comment by the public at least 30 calendar days prior to approval of projects. The report must analyze the aggregate locations of the funded projects, analyze the impacts in communities with the most significant exposure to air contaminants or localized air contaminants, or both, including, but not limited to, communities of minority populations or low-income populations, and identify agency outreach to community groups and other affected stakeholders.

(B) Projects must be selected and approved for funding in a publicly noticed meeting.”

This LHI report is not intended to be a detailed pollution analysis of proposed projects nor is it intended to substitute for the environmental review conducted during CEQA. This LHI report includes staff’s application of the EJSM developed by the U.S. EPA to help identify projects located in areas where social vulnerability indicators, high exposure to pollution, and greater health risks are present.

High-risk community project locations are identified using data from CARB, the U.S. Census Bureau, and other public agencies. Energy Commission staff analyzes these data to assign EJ indicators for each project location specified in the LHI report. The proposed project location must meet a two-part standard as follows:

### **Part 1 – Environmental Standard:**

- Communities located within an air quality nonattainment zone for ozone, PM 2.5, or PM 10, as designated by the California Air Resources Board for criteria pollutants.

### **Part 2 – Demographic Standard:**

- Communities having more than one of the following EJ indicators for (1) minority, (2) poverty, (3) unemployment, and (4) age. The EJ indicator thresholds are defined by staff as:
  - 1) A minority subset represents more than 30 percent of a given city’s population.

- 2) A city's poverty level exceeds the state average poverty level.
- 3) The city (or county if city data is unavailable) unemployment rate exceeds the state average unemployment rate.
- 4) The percentage of people living in a city who are younger than 5 years of age or older than 65 years of age is 20 percent higher than the state average for persons under 5 years of age or over 65 years of age.